COUNTY AGENDA REQUEST

Department:	Public Works	Presenter(s):	Phil Mallon
Meeting Date:	Thursday, May 23, 2013	Type of Request:	Consent

Wording for the Agenda:

Approval of staff's recommendation to award Proposal P869- Dam Engineering Services, to Walden, Ashworth & Associates, Inc. for Margaret Phillips Lake Dam, in an amount not to exceed $34,000, and authorization for the County Administrator to sign the contract and related documents.

Background/History/Details:

See attached memorandum for justification for award and background on the project need.

Fayette County has been directed by the Safe Dam Program to bring Category 1 dams into compliance. This recommendation concerns only the Margaret Phillips Lake Dam.

A Request for Proposals was prepared by the Engineering Department and advertised through the Purchasing Department. Additionally, notices of the RFP was sent to thirty (30) companies who are identified as Engineers of Record. Six companies responded to the RFP, of which one response was considered incomplete and removed from consideration. The remaining five companies were evaluated by Road and Public Works staff on a number of criteria. The recommendation of Walden, Ashworth & Associates, Inc. was decided on the proposed scope, references, and cost. Attachment 3 provides additional details on each respondent to the RFP.

The Request for Proposals and associated cost estimates are based on design for a dam breech (i.e.., removal). Additional fees may be incurred if a repair or replacement option is selected in lieu of a breech.

What action are you seeking from the Board of Commissioners?

Approval of staff's recommendation to award Proposal P869- Dam Engineering Services, to Walden, Ashworth & Associates, Inc. for Margaret Phillips Lake Dam, in an amount not to exceed $34,000, and authorization for the County Administrator to sign the contract and related documents.

If this item requires funding, please describe:

This work is being performed under directive by the Safe Dams Program. Funding is requested from the County's 375 Fund - Capital Improvement Projects contingency to fund this project via a budget amendment.

Has this request been considered within the past two years?	No	If so, when?	
Is Audio-Visual Equipment Required for this Request?*		Backup Provided with Request?	Yes

**** All audio-visual material must be submitted to the County Clerk's Office no later than 48 hours prior to the meeting. It is also your department's responsibility to ensure all third-party audio-visual material is submitted at least 48 hours in advance.***

Approved by Finance	Yes	Reviewed by Legal	
Approved by Purchasing	Yes	County Clerk's Approval	Yes
Administrator's Approval			

Staff Notes:

Recommended award is based on a base fee of $30,000 for Phillips plus $4,000 for additional surveying and modeling between Longview Road and SR 314. The fees per task, as provided in proposal, represent not-to-exceed limits. Engineering services include assessment of options for dam repair, replacement or removal. Further direction from the Board will be required to establish the desired course of action.

Fayette County GEORGIA

Where Quality Is A Lifestyle

TO: Fayette County Board of Commissioners

FROM: Phil Mallon, Public Works

Cc: Ted Burgess, Purchasing

DATE: May 15, 2013

RE: Award of Proposal P869 – Dam Engineering Services for Phillips Dam

In December 2012, Fayette County Public Works requested proposals from Professional Engineers to address compliance issues associated with three dams under the jurisdiction of the Georgia Department of Natural Resources, Environmental Protection Division, Safe Dam Program. Each of the three structures is at least partially within Fayette County right-of-way and two are Category 1 structures.

Per the Safe Dam Program there are four options for the Category 1 structures:

- Upgrade the dam;
- Breach the dam;
- Modify the dam to remove the downstream flood risk; and
- Remove or modify the downstream structure(s) at risk.

Fayette County has directive from the Safe Dam Program requiring action to bring the Category 1 structures into compliance by one of above-referenced four options. The first step in this process is to retain an "Engineer of Record" (i.e., an Engineer approved by the Safe Dam Program for work on Category 1 dams) for design work, including preparation of an Engineering Report.

This memo supports award of P869 for the Phillips Dam only. Additional input from the Board of Commissioners is required prior to award of engineering services for the other dams. The Engineer of Record will work with Fayette County to evaluate the four options for Phillips dam and present a recommendation to the Board of Commissioners.

Proposal Solicitation and Evaluation

A Request for Proposals was prepared by the Engineering Department and advertised by Purchasing thru the standard practices. In addition, Purchasing sent notices of the RFP to 30 companies who are identified as Engineers of Record.

Six companies responded to the RFP, of which one proposal was considered incomplete and removed from consideration. Of the five proposals deemed complete, they were compared using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP: scope of services, staff qualification, cost and references. All of the five proposals offered knowledgeable and experienced staff, therefore the recommendation was ultimately

decided on proposed scope, references and cost. The proposals were evaluated, independently, by Road and Public Works and each reviewer prepared a tabular score using these criteria.

The cost estimates for the work varied considerably, in some cases by more than a factor of three. One reason for this variation is that the scope was intentionally loose in order to allow the Consultants to offer approaches they felt most appropriate for the work.

Recommendation

It is staff's recommendation that award of P869 be given to Walden, Ashorth & Associates, Inc. for the Margaret Phillips Lake Dam with not-to-exceed costs of 34,000 each. (Walden Ashworth would be the recommended award if action is deemed appropriate for the Kozisek Dam as well.)

The Walden Ashworth proposal demonstrates a clear understanding of Fayette's needs, provides a logical and clear order of tasks, conveys an adequate quality control/quality assurance process for the production of documents, and offers a reasonable schedule. Of particular note in their proposal was the assurance that senior staff would be directly involved in the project implementation. The proposal also demonstrates significant and relevant experience with the Safe Dam Program.

From a cost perspective, Walden Ashworth offered the lowest fee at $34,000. The next lowest is $41,660. Staff did not see advantages of the next higher-cost proposal (or others) that justified the additional costs.

On March 27, 2013, I contacted Mr. Martin Walden of Walden Ashworth to confirm that the proposal is still valid given the delay in award and that Walden Ashworth is agreeable to billing on a time and material basis and only for work items deemed necessary by the County as the project is developed. For example, Task 5, Construction Phase Services, may be substantially reduced if the work is done by County crews. In addition, Mr. Walden agreed that the task fees are "not-to-exceed" limits.

Emerald Lake Dam

The RFP for this project included three dams. An award for Emerald Lake Dam is not recommended at this time for the following reasons:

- Emerald Lake Dam has not been classified by the Safe Dam Program as a Category 1 structure. We expect it will be at some point in the future but as of now there is no imperative to make improvements at this structure.
- The scope of work for Emerald Lake Dam is substantially different from the other two and warrants a separate evaluation.
- The funding source for the Emerald Lake Dam is also different. A separate, future award may help avoid confusion during the billing process.
- The work associated with Emerald Lake Dam is more complicated and expensive than the existing Category 1 structures. Staff feels it is in the County's best interest to gain additional experience with the Safe Dam program before proceeding on this project.
- No substantial discount was offered for award of all three projects, thus separate award does not result in a higher cost.

Background Information on the Dams

Below is some general information on each of the two dams associated with this proposal. The Category 1 classification indicates that the Safe Dams Program has concluded that a dam break or similar failure in the structure could result in loss of life or substantial property damage.

Margaret Phillips Lake Dam

State ID: 056-006-00821
Classification: Category 1
Visual Inspection Report: November 2012

Location: The dam is mostly within Longview Road right-of-way. Longview Road is located north of Fayetteville and runs parallel to SR 314.

Staff Comment: Breech the dam. Longview Road may be temporarily closed during construction and further evaluation is needed to determine if the benefit of maintaining Longview Road as a through-road justifies the cost of rebuilding the road with a stream crossing. During the design process, options for Longview Road shall be presented to the County for input prior to final design.

Kozisek Lake Dam (NOT RECOMMENDED AT THIS TIME)

State ID: 056-018-00910
Classification: Category 1
Visual Inspection Report: April 2012

Location: The dam is partially within Neely Road right-of-way. Neely Road intersects with Longview Road and the dam is approximately 1,500 feet upstream of the Margaret Phillips Lake Dam.

Staff Comment: Breech the dam. Neely Road may be temporarily closed during construction but the final design should address any repairs or modifications needed to road for its continued operation in the future. Existing cross drains should be used under Neely Road where possible to minimize project costs.

Attachment 2

Fayette County
"Where Quality Is a Lifestyle"
Purchasing Department
140 Stonewall Avenue West, Ste 101
Fayetteville, Georgia 30214
Phone: 770-305-5420
www.fayettecountyga.gov

To: Steve Rapson

From: Ted L. Burgess

Date: May 15, 2013

Subject: Engineering Services for Margaret Phillips Dam

The Purchasing Department released Request for Proposals #869 to procure the services of professional engineers. The need is to address compliance with requirements of the Georgia Department of Natural Resources, Environmental Protection Division, Safe Dam Program. The Department direct-mailed notice to 30 qualified companies. In addition, invitations were extended via the Fayette News, the county website, Georgia Local Government Access Marketplace (www.glga.org), and Channel 23.

Six companies submitted proposals. As stated in Public Works' document, one proposal was incomplete, leaving five for consideration (please see attachment). An Evaluation Committee composed of Public Works and the Road Department conducted an evaluation of the proposals, based 70% on technical merit and 30% on price, as stipulated in the Request for Proposals. Walden, Ashworth & Associates, Inc received the best score. Public Works recommends that firm for the compliance work on Margaret Phillips Dam, at a not-to-exceed cost of $34,000. I concur with their recommendation.

Attachment

Attachment 3

PROPOSAL NUMBER: #P869

PROPOSAL NAME: DAM ENGINEERING SERVICES

	RESPONDENT NAME:	MARGARET PHILLIPS LAKE DAM	KOZISEK LAKE DAM	EMERALD LAKE DAM	TOTAL	DISCOUNT IF AWARDED TWO OR MORE
1.	GOLDER ASSOCIATES INC.	$158,980.50	$151,400.50	$118,532.50	$428,913.50	NONE
2.	KIMLEY-HORN AND ASSOCIATES, INC.	$89,800.00	$76,400.00	$94,800.00	$261,000.00	$4,000 (1) $6,100 (2)
3.	RILEY PARK HAYDEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.	$41,660.00	$40,230.00	$36,570.00	$118,460.00	$7,575.00
4.	SADLER ASSOCIATES INC., CIVIL ENGINEERING & LAND SURVEYING	Disqualified	Disqualified	Disqualified	Disqualified	Disqualified
5.	SCHNABEL DAM ENGINEERING, INC.	$95,500.00	$80,000.00	$151,000.00	$326,500.00	N/A
6.	WALDEN, ASHWORTH & ASSOCIATES, INC.	$34,000.00*	$34,000.00	$111,000.00	$179,000.00	$5,000.00

*Includes $4,000 for data gathering & modeling between Lonview Road and SR 314.

(1) Applies to Margaret Phillips Lake Dam & Kozisek Lane Dam only.
(2) Additional discount assumes construction operations for Kozisek & Margaret Phillips Lake dams occur simultaneously.